

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2/22/16 6/16/06	Document: INCITS Ballot 007-06 INCITS 1574-D, Information technology - Geographic Information Framework Data Content Standards.
----------------------------------	---

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	
MB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Tabl e/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Editing Comments (JC)
	Part 7 Transportation						
	Introduction						Added new introduction for consistency with the other parts. What we had in there before was basically the same as the Base Document introduction.
		line 275					We added a paragraph that we deleted from the Rail part.
		line 276					Added paragraph per author's corrected draft.
Ben	7:3	line 290	ed	missing sentence	Add the following after the first sentence of the first paragraph: "No additional normative references are specified for the Transportation base (Part 7)."	AAS	Done. "Base" was capitalized for consistency. We capitalized the names of the parts in the main text whenever they were used as an abbreviated forms of the names of parts.
Ben	7:5.2,9,13	lines 329, 360, and 376	ed	are defined terms bolded if they occur in a note?	make "position expression" bold face if appropriate	AAS	Terms defined elsewhere are not supposed to be bolded in the term notes or examples. I checked through the rest of the framework parts and there was only one instance in the parts that went to INCITs where a term was bolded in a note, the definition of "grid" in Elevation. (Apparently, I actually noticed this before Elevation was posted for submittal to INCITS, but didn't fix it because I had already made the pdf, it was 11:08 PM on a Friday night, and I wanted to go home.)
Ben	7:5.7	lines 350-352	ed	geometry already defined in Part 0 as clause 5.27	delete clause	AAS	Done. I renumbered the rest of the terms.
Ben	7:5.10	line 363-4	ed	the thing being measured does not have to be a feature	change both occurrences of "feature" to "linear element"	AAS	Done and bolded.

Type of comment: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2/22/16 6/16/06	Document: INCITS Ballot 007-06 INCITS 1574-D, Information technology - Geographic Information Framework Data Content Standards.
----------------------------------	---

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	
MB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Tabl e/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Editing Comments (JC)
Ben	7:5.14	line 379	ed	awkward wording	change “ linear reference ” to “the linear referencing ”	AAS	Done and unbolded (“linear reference” is a defined term, while “linear referencing” is not).
Ben	7:5.21	line 406	ed	incomplete definition	change “TranPaths, TranPoints, TranSegs” to “ transportation segmentation model features as well as other features relevant to transportation”	AAS	Done. I added a comma before “as well as. I noticed that the author had moved “TranFeature” to the same line as “transportation feature”. I left this and other class names like it below the terms for consistency.
Ben	7:5.25	line 425	ed	incomplete definition	add “(TranPaths, TranPoints, and TranSegs)” after “ features ”	AAS	Done. I made these singular, so there wouldn't be any question of whether or not they should be bolded.

Type of comment: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: ~~2/22/16~~ 6/16/06

Document: INCITS Ballot 007-06 INCITS 1574-D, Information technology - Geographic Information Framework Data Content Standards.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	
MB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Tabl e/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Editing Comments (JC)
Ben	7:7		ge	<u>Segmentation Model</u> <u>Change:</u> The segmentation model requires all TranSegs to terminate with TranPoints. This was stipulated to insure that the resultant set of TranSegs form a complete coverage of the transportation system without gaps or overshoots. To accommodate systems without TranPoints, the model allows TranPaths to exist without an underlying TranSeg. Feedback received indicates that some people are incorrectly using TranPaths to model the physical roadway to get around the TranPoint constraint. This defeats the agreed purpose of TranPaths as a particular USE of the TranSegs with TranSegs representing the physical roadway. This normalized view allows the physical transportation system to be defined once and then used in any number of ways.	Make start point and end point TranPoints optional for a TranSeg but make TranSegs mandatory for TranPaths. Specific changes are included below and referenced back to this general comment. Similar changes will need to be made to Parts 7b, 7c, and 7d.	AAS – addressed in text pleas make changes to the figures to reflect these changes.	Done. Figures 1, 3, and 5 replaced and changes made to rows 9, 33, and 34 of data dictionary.

Type of comment: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2/22/16 6/16/06	Document: INCITS Ballot 007-06 INCITS 1574-D, Information technology - Geographic Information Framework Data Content Standards.
----------------------------------	---

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	
MB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Tabl e/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Editing Comments (JC)
Ben	7:7.2	line 453	ed	add clarity to differentiate other possible tran features	add "explicit" before "feature subclasses"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.2	line 456	ed	incomplete thought	change "transportation features" to "TranFeature or user-defined TranFeature subtypes"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.3.1	line 463-5	ed	incorrect wording	change the first occurrence of "The transportation network" to "The transportation segmentation model" and the second occurrence to "It"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.3.1	line 467	te	See comment 7:7 <u>Segmentation Model Change</u> above	Change "TranSegs are" to "It is highly recommended that TranSegs be"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.3.2	line 489-90	te	See comment 7:7 <u>Segmentation Model Change</u> above	change "must have" to "is recommended to have"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.3.3	line 492	ed	meaning not clear enough	change "TranPoints provide" to "The sole purpose of TranPoints is to provide"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.3.3	line 492	te	See comment 7:7 <u>Segmentation Model Change</u> above	change "Each TranSeg must" to "It is highly recommended that each TranSeg"	AAS	Done

Type of comment: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: ~~2/22/16~~ 6/16/06

Document: INCITS Ballot 007-06 INCITS 1574-D, Information technology - Geographic Information Framework Data Content Standards.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	
MB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Tabl e/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Editing Comments (JC)
Ben	7:7.3.2	line 493	te	See comment 7:7 <u>Segmentation Model</u> <u>Change</u> above	add new sentences before "If a ...": "This will help insure that the resultant set of TranSegs forms a complete coverage of the transportation system without gaps or overlaps. For exchanging datasets without such explicit connectivity, TranPoints can be considered to be optional."	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.3.3	line 498	ed	unclear reference	change "its" to "the intersection"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.3.3	Figure 3	te	See comment 7:7 <u>Segmentation Model</u> <u>Change</u> above	Change multiplicity of TranSeg side of its association with TranPath from 0..* to 1..*. Change multiplicities of TranPoint end of associations with TranSeg from 1..* to 0..*. These changes should ripple down to Figures 1 and 5 as well. Update Table 1 accordingly: Row 9 O becomes M; rows 33 and 34 change from M to O	AAS	Done. Figures 1, 3, 5 replaced and data dictionary corrected.
Ben	7:7.3.3	line 508	ed	improper ISO wording	change "are not to be" to "shall not be"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.3.4	line 524	ed	not emphatic enough	change "can" to "shall"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.3.4	line 528	ed	improper class name	change "feature class" to "Feature class"	AAS	Done

Type of comment: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: ~~2/22/16~~ 6/16/06

Document: INCITS Ballot 007-06 INCITS 1574-D, Information technology - Geographic Information Framework Data Content Standards.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	
MB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Tabl e/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Editing Comments (JC)
Ben	7:7.3.4	line 528 (531)	ed	improper word	change "receives" to "inherits"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.3.4	line 528 (531)	ed	missing word	add "TranSeg" before "parts"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.3.5	Table 1	ed	stereotypes in element rows are redundant with those in the entity rows to which they refer	for all element rows, drop the stereotype value. Ditto for table 2	AAS	Did not do. We've talked about this in the past with Charles Roswell and concluded that showing the stereotypes for the elements is an appropriate redundancy. Showing the stereotypes in the tables helps programmers and data dictionary readers know what the data type is when they are classes (feature, data type, enumeration, code list, leaf, etc.). Programmers would not necessarily know what stereotype is and would have to look them up in the ISO standards. For this reason, the stereotypes have been shown in all the framework parts.
Ben	7:7.3.5	Table 1	ed	ExtendedAttributes should be singularized	change "ExtendedAttributes" to "ExtendedAttribue" in Data Type column of rows 4, 15, and 26	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.3.5	Table 1	te	Equivalencies can involve whole or partial entities on either from or to end	In rows 10 and 11, change the Domain from "Unrestricted" to "Whole or partial TranPaths". In rows 35 and 36, change the Domain from "Unrestricted" to "Whole or partial TranSegs".	AAS	Done. In row 9, left "TranSeg" as is in definition. It wasn't called to be changed and I think "Transeg" is correct, but I wanted to draw your attention to it, just in case.

Type of comment: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: ~~2/22/16~~ 6/16/06

Document: INCITS Ballot 007-06 INCITS 1574-D, Information technology - Geographic Information Framework Data Content Standards.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	
MB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Tabl e/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Editing Comments (JC)
Ben	7:7.3.5	Table 1	te	Missing entity TranFeature. By adding it, rows for identifier, metadata, attribute, and lastUpdateDate can be eliminated from TranSeg, TranPoint, and TranPath entities.	<p>Replace row 1 with values (1, TranFeature, A transportation Feature, , , <<Feature>>, Lines 2-7).</p> <p>For rows 2-4 and 6-7, precede Name/Role Name column value with "Framework::Feature::" to show the elements are inherited from Framework.Feature.</p> <p>For rows 2, 5, 6 change "TranPath" to "TranFeature" in the Definition column.</p> <p>Change row 6 Data Type to "GM_Object".</p> <p>Change row 7 Data Type to "TP_Object".</p> <p>Add new, shaded row 8 with values from old row 1 (TranPath), but update Domain lines to be 9-14.</p> <p>New rows 9-14 should contain values from old rows 6-11.</p> <p>New, shaded row 15 should have values from old line 12 (TranPoint) except Domain should be "Lines 16-21".</p> <p>New rows 16-21 should contain values from old rows 17-22.</p> <p>New, shaded row 22 should have values from old line 23 (TranSeg) but update Domain to "Lines 23-31"</p> <p>New rows 23-31 should contain values from old rows 28-36.</p>	AAS	<p>Done. Put new rows 2-7 in proper order, per figure.</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done. Changed stereotype to Interface.</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done. Put new rows 9-14 in proper order, per figure.</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done. Changed stereotype of TranSeg in row 19 to Abstract. <u>Did not change</u>, but should the O/C for new rows 18 & 19 be O?</p> <p>Done</p> <p>Done</p>

Type of comment: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: ~~2/22/16~~ 6/16/06

Document: INCITS Ballot 007-06 INCITS 1574-D, Information technology - Geographic Information Framework Data Content Standards.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	
MB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Tabl e/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Editing Comments (JC)
Ben	7:7.4	Figure 6	ed	it is not clear what distinguishes the differences in shading of the class boxes	be consistent with class box shading unless there is a reason not to (and if so, then document why) in this and all figures	AAS	Figures 1-3 and 5-7 were replaced.
Ben	7:7.4	line 550	ed	add words for clarity	add "TranSeg or TranPath" before "linear feature"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.4	line 552	ed	wrong word – this is an exchange standard	change "store" to "specify"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.4	line 560	ed	add words for clarity	add "other than TranSegs, TranPaths, and TranPoints" after "TranFeatures"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.4	line 564	ed	for better readability	"As shown..." s hould start a new paragraph	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.4	line 571	ed	change words to improve clarity	change "along the feature" to "along the TranSeg or TranPath"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.4.1	line 578	ed	add word for clarity	add "two" after "using"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.4.2	line 597-8	ed	add parentheses and words for greater clarity	Add " - see below" to the end of the sentence which begins "If more information" and put the entire sentence within parentheses.	AAS	Done. Question whether parens are necessary. Changed " - see below" to the more specific, "See section 7.4.4 below."
Ben	7:7.4.2	line 598	ed	for better readability	"PointAttributeevents..." should start a new paragraph	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.4.3	line 606	ed	add word for clarity	add "itself" after "with the feature"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.4.3	line 607	ed	add word for clarity	add "two" after "using"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.4.3	line 612	ed	add words for clarity	add "by LinearFeatureEvents" after "supported"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.4.3	line 613	ed	add word for clarity	add "feature" after "County"	AAS	Done

Type of comment: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2/22/16 6/16/06

Document: INCITS Ballot 007-06 INCITS 1574-D, Information technology - Geographic Information Framework Data Content Standards.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	
MB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Tabl e/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Editing Comments (JC)
Ben	7:7.4.4	line 618	ed	add word for clarity	add "single" after "using a"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:7.4.5	Table 2	ed	wrong word	change "Road" to "transportation" in Definition column of rows 55 and 56	AAS	Done. Renumbered line numbers in Domain column. In row 43, changed Data Type stereotype to Abstract, per figure.
Ben	7:Annex A	para 1, sentence 2	ed	improve wording	add underlined text, delete strikeout text: For example, different databases will <u>may</u> have different positional accuracies, and different linear reference methods (LRMs), to represent the same piece of the transportation system and or <u>different schemes for partitioning</u> <u>(segmenting) the transportation</u> <u>network</u> End and users may have a variety of compelling business needs to distinguish each representation but also know that each is a representation of the same piece of the transportation system.	AAS	Done Done Done
Ben	7:Annex A	line 648	ed	add words for clarity	add "a single RoadSeg with" after "dataset includes"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:Annex A	line 652	ed	add words for clarity	add "(SR 47)" after "road segment"	AAS	Done
Ben	7:Annex A	line 680	te	missing arithmetic operator; wrong units	change "3.00 x 25.46% 5.5 miles" to "(3.00 / 5.5) x 25.46%"	AAS	Done

Type of comment: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2/22/16 6/16/06	Document: INCITS Ballot 007-06 INCITS 1574-D, Information technology - Geographic Information Framework Data Content Standards.
----------------------------------	---

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	
MB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Tabl e/Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment 2	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	Editing Comments (JC)
Ben	7:Annex B		ed	missing reference	Add as the first sentence: "This annex is Clause 6.6 from ISO 19133:2005, Geographic information – Location based services – Tracking and navigation."	AAS	Done. I made "clause" lower case.

Type of comment: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10